

P-ISSN ----  
E-ISSN ----



**Jurnal Ilmiah Mahasiswa Pendidikan**  
Volume 1, Nomor 1, September 2020

## **AN ANALYSIS OF TEACHER'S STRATEGIES IN TEACHING SPEAKING SKILL TO VISUALLY IMPAIRMENT STUDENTS AT SMA LUAR BIASA BANDA ACEH IN ACADEMIC YEAR 2019/2020**

**Khadijah, Sri Wahyuni, dan Hijjatul Qamariah**  
Program Studi Pendidikan Bahasa Inggris  
STKIP Bina Bangsa Getsempena Banda Aceh  
Email: khadijahdijah78@gmail.com

### **ABSTRAK**

Penelitian ini bertujuan untuk menggambarkan strategi guru dalam mengajar keterampilan berbicara kepada siswa tunanetra di SMA Luar Biasa Banda Aceh. Hal ini dilakukan untuk mengetahui apa yang guru terapkan dalam mengajar keterampilan berbicara kepada kelas kebutuhan khusus siswa tunanetra seperti strategi yang digunakan guru, dan masalah serta solusi yang dihadapi dalam pelaksanaan proses belajar mengajar. Metodologi yang digunakan dalam penelitian ini adalah metode kualitatif. Subjek penelitian adalah guru di SMA Luar Biasa. Data dikumpulkan melalui wawancara dengan guru bahasa Inggris. Teknik analisis data yang digunakan dalam penelitian ini adalah analisis model interaktif yang diadopsi adalah dari Yin, yaitu: menyusun, membongkar, memasang kembali, menafsirkan, dan menyimpulkan. Hasil penelitian menunjukkan bahwa strategi yang digunakan oleh guru hanya strategi tanya jawab. Masalah yang dihadapi oleh guru saat mengajar siswa tunanetra adalah pertama, semua siswa dengan tingkat yang berbeda duduk dalam satu kelas. Kedua, tidak ada pengajaran tim dan akhirnya, sekolah kekurangan fasilitas. Namun, hasilnya menunjukkan bahwa belum ada solusi untuk masalah tersebut.

**Kata Kunci:** strategi guru, kemampuan berbicara, tunanetra

### **ABSTRACT**

*This study is aimed at portraying teacher's strategies in teaching speaking skill to visually impairment students at SMA Luar Biasa Banda Aceh. It is conducted to know what the teacher implemented in teaching speaking skill to special needs class with visually – impairment students such as the strategies that the teacher used, and the problems and solutions were faced in the implementation of teaching learning process. The methodology employed in this research is a qualitative method. The subject of the research is the teacher at SMA Luar Biasa. The data were collected through interview with an English teacher. The technique of data analysis used in this research was interactive model analysis adopted is from Yin, those are: compiling, disassembling, reassembling, interpreting, and concluding. The result revealed that strategy used by the teacher was only question and answer strategy. The problems faced by the teacher while teaching visually impairment students were firstly, all students with different levels were seated in one class. Secondly,*

*there was no team-teaching and finally, the school had lack of facilities. However, the result showed that there was no solution for those problems yet.*

**Keywords:** *teacher's strategies, speaking skill, visually-impairment*

## **INTRODUCTION**

Teaching means giving or transferring knowledge and making someone understand what the teachers have been taught. In teaching the teacher guides the students to learn about new knowledge. It is relevant with Brown (2007:7) that teaching is showing or helping someone to learn how to do something, giving instruction, guiding in the study of something, providing with knowledge, causing to know or understand. In teaching speaking, teacher faces so many difficulties, so that teachers should have trick and good away to improve the students' ability on speaking. To improve the speaking skill, teachers should know how to teach well. According to Gerlach and Ely in Istanto (2017:4) strategy in teaching is a ways that have chose to deliver the teaching method in teaching learning. It means that teacher needs strategy in teaching the students.

Teaching of speaking is having high concern in many language programs, which is due to the ever-growing needs for fluency of English. Given the fact, teaching strategies cannot be denied as a factor influencing the teaching outcome. Strategies employed to achieve the ability to write and speak would be different because the goals of each skill are not the same. The former is concerned with ability to produce written language, whereas the latter mainly focuses on producing oral language (Anjaniputra, 2013:1). Moreover, the strategies for teaching English skills should be made based on each skill in order to attain the expected outcomes. Regarding strategies for teaching speaking, it is ironic that, based on experience of the researcher during studying in high school, most of students of secondary school were not able to speak English. Furthermore, those who graduated from secondary school do not have sufficient ability for English speaking since the teaching of English in Indonesia is deemed to be unsuccessful (Cahyono and Widiati, 2011:2). Therefore, the portrayal of speaking teaching strategies is going to be investigated.

Based on Fisher in Wahyuni and Yulianti (2016:16), speaking is an interaction that done by someone to someone else to gather information, share and exchange ideas using spoken language. Efficient communication is the goal for speaking learning. In teaching speaking, the teacher should use and give more opportunities for students to practice their speaking, it means building more students' self confidence. In order to optimize the application of teaching strategies, the teacher should be aware of the difficulties that faced by the students before practicing it. Teacher is suggested to know the students problem individually.

Speaking is momentary, and obligation to process in unfeigned time, while the written language becomes permanent and can be read. Meanwhile, speakers have to plan, formulate, and deliver their utterance, then writers spend more time to plan, review and revise their words (Ginusti, 2014:15) to be capable to communicate equally speakers and listeners necessity to be presents during the activity. Unlike writing, the speaker doesn't need to use a large amount in sequence to enhance an implication as they employ a good

deal of diplomacy such as stress, intonation, pitch, volume, pausing. From the difficulty of clauses, speakers have a propensity to own shorter clauses than the writers do.

Before discussing about teaching strategies of speaking, it is better to see the principles of designing speaking strategies that suggested by Brown (2007:331) there are some strategies in teaching speaking skill including: (1) focusing on both fluency and accuracy, depending on your objectives, (2) providing intrinsically motivating strategies, (3) encouraging the use of authentic language in meaningful contexts, (4) providing appropriate feedback and correction, (5) capitalizing on the natural link between speaking and listening, (6) giving students opportunities to initiate oral communication and encouraging then development of speaking strategies. Whatever the strategy that will be used, the teacher should consider those principles. It is important in order to achieve the goal of learning.

Speaking is one of the language art of talk as communication interaction with someone, and it is very difficult to master it (Untari, 2017:14). From those information above it was likely to lead to problems in teaching and learning speaking skill. The limited area of the language may influence students' interest in speaking. Thus, the strategies of teacher was very important not any to maintain the class but also to encourage, support and build students' interest in the subject that he taught. Even though it is not an easy thing to do by teacher but he should find the appropriate strategy to apply in the classroom which suit the learners' level. There are so many strategies that could be used by teacher but not all of the strategies could be appropriate and suit the learners' level.

Nevertheless, a lot of students have difficulty in learning speaking by communicating improperly in expressing ideas, choosing words, and having the confidence to speak. Being a teacher is not as easy as the people think, because the teacher carry out in emergent their identifiable in developing their own professional knowledge and practice (Loughran, 2010:1). Supported by Agnyoto (2012:4) interaction and expressing ideas are problems faced by the students in communicating because they usually feel insecure about their level of English. They turn into models for their students. Thus, the teacher's feelings and conduct would mainly expected be imitated by their students in the class. Therefore, teachers supposed to exceedingly be the cause of their students to the objectives to be achieved for the reason that the complete depend on them.

According to Pinter (2017:54) the teachers' basic to build the flourishing activities are based on students' requirements in language learning. In addition, with that statement, Harmer (2007:102) teachers are requisite to make an effort to equal their actions into lesson with the students in teaching and learning activity. Thus, the statements above suggest that it is essential for teacher to consider the students' need in selecting activities to deliver the material.

On the other hand, teaching students with special needs requires different strategies. There are many types of disability in the classroom, one of the disorders is vision impairment. Newman (2004:12) emphasizes that students with learning disabilities need further to help stimulation, and encouragement to enlarge skills than other students. It can be concluded that teaching English to disabled students are different from teaching

enabled one since they have diverse abilities and learning needs. These differences can be on the teaching activities that should be developed by the teacher.

Speaking is symbolized as a mode for people to put across their feeling to others. Through speaking, humans are capable to join their watch out in every bearing of life. They preserve contribute to their opinions, thoughts, and drawn their emotion. Hence, limitations in vision in blind students, they are better off learning through audio and oral means because that is one of the most necessary skill in English teaching for the students with special needs. However, there are some problems in teaching speaking in the class because the ability to speak English is a very complex task considering the nature of what is involved in speaking (Safitri, 2013:2). The problems are visual impaired students have different needs, and have limited skills for learning especially learning English, students are confused what the teacher told to them because of different words which have different letter but similar sound like she, see and sea. Then supported by obstacles during the learning process such as students less understand as enable students of the material, and students have to take long process to memorize the story. Along with the ideas above, Wulandari in Safitri (2013:2) proposes: teaching speaking is teaching students to produce the English speech sound and sound patterns, use word and sentence stress, intonation patterns and the rhythm of language, select appropriate words and sentences, and use the language quickly and confidently with few unnatural pause, which is called as fluency. By considering those complexities, one aspect in teaching speaking which is important for teacher to be taken care of is the development of activities.

Being visual impaired students in inclusion class is difficult. It can be seen in the result of Pre-research. Based on Untari (2017:16-17) visual impaired students have to learn English together with normal. They did not get special treatment by the teacher to more understanding the lesson. They also learnt the same English material with normal students, without any special method, visual impaired students less understand of the material that delivered by the teacher and the understanding level of visual impaired students is not fast as normal students.

In conclusion, this study is concerned with the teaching speaking skill which were conducted by the teacher in a special needs class with vision impaired students. Therefore, the researcher was conducted a research entitled "An Analysis of Teacher's Strategies in Teaching Speaking Skill to Visually Impairment Students at SMA Luar Biasa Banda Aceh in Academic Year 2019/2020". The problem in this study stated as follow: what are the strategies used by the teacher in teaching speaking skill in a special needs class with visually-impaired students?

## **RESEARCH METHODOLOGY**

The type of this research is descriptive qualitative research. This research focuses in teacher's strategies in the teaching speaking skill to Senior High School in SMA Luar Biasa BUKESRA Banda Aceh. Tohirin (2012:3) argued qualitative research is a research to comprehend phenomena which is experienced by the subject of research for example behavior, perception, motivation, and action. There are some characteristics of qualitative research, those are: qualitative research has the natural setting as the direct source of data and researcher is the key instrument. Qualitative research is descriptive, the data collected is in the form of words of pictures rather than number (Sugiyono, 2008:8-13).

Qualitative method is considered relevant in this study because of two main reasons: (1) the researcher only explore teaching strategies in the speaking skill by teacher and did not attempt to develop this strategy, and (2) the researcher also observed phenomena found in teaching English to blind students regarding class activities. So the researcher emphasized the effort to find out the teacher's strategy in teaching speaking skills. Based on the statement above, the researcher investigated information about the teacher's strategies in teaching speaking skill to Visually Impairment Students of teaching speaking used by the teacher. Therefore, Qualitative research is appropriate to be used in the researcher's study. In this research, the researcher investigated kinds of strategies of teaching speaking skill used by the teacher in Vision Impaired Students so that the researcher used descriptive qualitative method.

Qualitative data is a lot gathered in the style of words, pictures, or equally (Lodico et. al. 2006:116). To be exact and to avert bias, Lodico et. al. (2006:11) assert that the information assembly practice has got to be systematical, and the facts recorded with accuracy. Qualitative researcher function a kind of follow a line of investigation tools, but they frequently desire to conduct interviews.

This research employed one technique of data collection. The technique used is interview. The interview is addressed to the teacher in this study. For the teacher, the interview was intended to enrich researcher's understanding about the data obtained to make clarification of what remained 'blur' related to classroom speaking skill.

In order to get problems or clarify initial topic, a researcher should conduct the data. According to Mukhtar (2007:88) there are two techniques to collect the data in qualitative research as a base field research, which are: classroom observation and interview. However, as a researcher was done one technique to collect the data namely interview.

The interview was made based on principles introduced by Gall, et. al. (2007:239), which involves (1) the informal conversational interview, (2) the general interview guide approach, and (3) the standardized open-ended interview. The interview is conducted through phone call. In this study the researcher used the data analysis process suggested by Yin (2016:187). According to Yin (2016:187) there are five- phased series of analyzing qualitative data: compiling, disassembling, reassembling (and arraying), interpreting, and concluding.

## ***RESEARCH FINDING AND DISCUSSION***

The interview was conducted in June 26<sup>th</sup> 2020. The researcher did interview to the teacher. The researcher asked fifteen questions about the teaching and learning process of speaking to the English teacher. Those all questions were related to the strategies that the teacher used in the class during the teaching and learning process.

Teaching strategies used by the teacher in teaching speaking skill are very useful and helpful for the students and the strategies are very interested to be implemented to improve speaking skill. Students have a lot of opportunity to practice speaking and have active involvement in speaking.

The good language learners spoke English fluently, but sometimes they found some problems in speaking so they used certain strategies to solve their problems. Meanwhile,

visual impaired students in the school SMA Luar Biasa Banda Aceh less practice their speaking in inside or outside class. Because they still lack of vocabulary and hard to understanding the material.

This part presents the research findings which the researcher found in the field by doing interview. It is related to the teacher's strategies in teaching speaking at SMA Luar Biasa BUKESRA Banda Aceh. After the researcher investigated the teacher's strategies in teaching speaking, finally, the researcher got some data. In this phase, the researcher formed the data into fifteen substantive theme. The themes are all about the element of Teacher Strategies in Teaching Speaking Skill with Visual Impairment Students. Therefore, the themes found from the interview are as the following:

### ***Types of Strategies the Teacher Commonly Use in Teaching Speaking***

The strategy that the teacher used question and answer (Interview) in teaching speaking to vision impairment students. The teaching speaking by the teacher is combined in one class at different levels and the learning proses is only done in two weeks of one meeting and the questions given by the teacher about their daily activities so that the question and answer strategy is very suitable to use. Meanwhile, the teacher give questions to visually impaired students, the teacher used English and Indonesia language because her students lack of vocabulary and they are still new to know English. The teacher's goal to use that strategy is to improve students understanding what she is asking during learning proses.

### ***Dominant Strategy that the Teacher Used in Teaching Speaking Skill***

When the researcher asked about what strategy that is dominantly applied in teaching. The teacher answered the dominant strategy is question and answer but that is not full in English language yet the teacher used more dominant Indonesia language. Subsequently, the teacher gives a translate to blind students to make them understand.

### ***Question and Answer Strategy were Applied***

Before the teacher teach the students, the teacher provided and arranged the strategy that was appropriate to teach. The problems in learning speaking to visual impairment students are related to the background of their knowledge which is very lack of vocabulary and has limited times of study. In the end, the teacher only used the question and answer, and discussion strategies that best suits them during the learning process.

### ***Question and Answer was Applied in Every Topic Taught***

Based on the interview with the English teacher, the researcher found that question and answer strategy was used by the teacher in teaching speaking for each topic she taught. The use of strategy is considered important because the strategy would increase the probability that students could learn more and the knowledge would retain better in their mind. Thus, the teacher only used question and answer as a good strategy because the time for learning speaking is not much and it does not focus on speaking only.

### ***Students' Response to the Activities and Strategies Applied in Teaching Speaking Skill***

From the interview, the researcher could identify the interaction towards the implementation of teaching strategy that is used by the teacher. From the interview, it could be concluded (see Appendix 2 of interview guidance) that students were enthusiastic in learning speaking. The students paid attention to the teacher's explanation and they enjoyed every class activity. Thus, by having positive responses, the students would have good classroom interaction on teaching learning activities such as correcting the mistakes make understand about the lesson.

### ***Media Used in Teaching Speaking***

Classroom interaction is defined as the interaction between teacher and students in the classroom that enhances the development of the language skills. Based on interview that was done by the researcher, media helped the teacher in conducting teaching and learning activity in the class. It made teacher easier in delivering knowledge during learning speaking. However, before using the media, the teacher should know whether the media is useful or not and the teacher should choose the media that will be used in teaching speaking based the material needs in order to reach the goal of learning. Meanwhile, the school have lack of infrastructure, technology, and other problems, so the teacher only used text book or the material from internet.

### ***Media Help the Teacher in Teaching Learning Process and Student Learning Outcomes***

Based on the interview with the teacher, the teacher said that they often used question and answer strategy in teaching speaking. Then, the teacher would use text book or internet as a media.

### ***Teacher Strategy in Coping with a Troubling Student***

Based on the interview with the English teacher, the researcher found that there was a troubling students that the teacher got. The difficulty of the teacher was taught and had explained the material to be discussed, the students answer yes, but students do not understand what is explained by the teacher but when the teacher was given questions or asked questions they cannot answer.

### ***Teacher Encourage Students to Express Their Creativity***

One of the way to encourage students to speak is question and answer and translated the meaning of the words, the teacher had applied indirectly and directly. It would encourage students to express their creativity to produce English sentence.

### ***Teacher's Support to Get Students Involve in Learning Speaking***

Essentially students need the support from the teacher. Effective communication is the key to support the students. Showing interest, providing encouragement, listening carefully, and asking leading questions are ways of providing support. When students encounter difficulties, the teacher can listen to what the students are experiencing and can ask questions that help the students identify effective solutions.

### ***Teacher's Approach to Make the Student Participate in the Classroom***

In almost every class, there are at least one or two students who are reluctant to participate in what is going on. This is especially the case in mandatory language classes like when the teacher is teaching English in the class. On the other hand, based on the interview the teacher said that peer assistance is the way to approach the students to get involve in the class activity.

### ***Teacher's Assessment towards Students' Speaking Ability***

Learning how to teach and assess speaking skill are probably one of the biggest challenges from the teacher. The teacher should pay attention to aspects such as: fluency, pronunciation, vocabulary, accuracy, interaction, and communication. However, from the interview the teacher said that she assess the students not based on the students' speaking ability, but the teacher assess it based on the teacher observation on the students performance in the classroom and how the students responses during teaching learning process.

### ***The Obstacles Faced by Teacher in Achieving Students' Speaking Competence***

Sometimes the teacher has a problem or obstacle in managing the classroom. The teacher got difficulty to manage the classroom because every students has different characteristic. Based on the interview on Friday, 26 June 2020, the researcher found that some of obstacle faced by the teacher was difficulty to control the class. So, the teaching learning process did not run well.

### ***Obstacles in Dealing with Achieving Students' Speaking Competence***

Based on the interview that the researcher did with the teacher, the most difficult obstacle is the teacher must teach three different classes at once and make it compatible with the lesson plan so that the teacher uses learning with random material during the teaching learning process.

### ***The Solution in Dealing with Obstacles in Achieving Speaking Competence***

Based on the interview that was done by the researcher, the researcher found that there were some problems faced by the teacher in teaching speaking skill. The teacher stated that she did not have any solution towards those problems yet.

The research finding include speaking learning process of visually impaired students in inclusion class and the way to solve the problem that the teacher faced when applying the teaching strategy in speaking. In discussion session, the researcher tried to justify the description of the research finding based on the following explanation:

### ***The strategy that was used by the teacher in teaching speaking skill to vision impaired students at SMA Luar Biasa BUKESRA Banda Aceh.***

The teacher only gave the visual impairment students printed book (text book) or found the material from the internet to be used in the class. There is no special method or media that were used by the teacher to teach visual impaired students.



The teacher should give the most support to the vision impairment students. The teacher can integrate some method, strategy, and media. The teacher can use media, especially audio media (audio recording and speech) to support learning process. The teacher also could ask students about learning aids that they might need during the activity. It would make the material organized and easily accessible and understood by the students.

***The problems faced in teaching speaking by the teacher to visually impairment students at SMA Luar Biasa Banda Aceh.***

In speaking skill, visual impaired students in the class have some problem such as lack of vocabulary, lack of speaking practice so the students speak to people, they use almost all in Indonesian. The teacher should do other strategies besides question and answer namely creating readiness for learning, providing motivation, providing guidance as needed, arousing the effects of shame and reducing excessive anger.

***The way to solve the problems that faced in teaching speaking by the teacher to visually impaired students at SMALB BUKESRA Banda Aceh.***

The problems were students lack of vocabulary, the time to learnt was limited, and students just keep quiet the teacher mention that there was no solution for that yet. Teacher in the class used to document students attempt to assist a troubled student, but if the strategy did not work, the teacher should do peer teaching, use audio media, class devision based on students' level and do working with their parents.

**CONCLUSION AND SUGGESTION**

This present study was aimed at investigating the teaching strategies conducted by the teacher in teaching the speaking skill to visually-impairment students. It was also conducted to find out the visual impaired students' responses to the implementation of teaching speaking conducted by the teacher in the classroom. Regarding the teaching strategies in speaking skill, obstacles faced in teaching speaking, and the way to solve the problems faced by the teacher in teaching speaking which were gathered through interview, it was concluded that the teacher used question and answer strategy in speaking skill to students with vision impaired.

Then, she said that she often use printed book or the material from the internet to make the students to be easier in learning and understand the material given.

The main obstacles that come from the students were lack of vocabulary, short time to teach them and lack of improvement in the school. However, the teacher does not have any solution for those problems. Therefore, the teaching process cannot be achieve as the desired target.

Based on the research finding, discussions, and conclusions of this research, the researcher proposes several suggestions for a English teacher and future researcher.

Firstly, it is suggested that the teacher uses other strategies of teaching speaking in accordance with students' characteristics and level of proficiency. Secondly, the teacher should provide interactive materials which involve students to be active by using various available media or learning aids in teaching speaking. Third, the strategies applied by the

teacher in teaching speaking skill to vision impaired students were mostly passive activities. Therefore, the teacher might implement the strategies which require students to speak actively such as storytelling and role play. The last suggestions, the researcher only carried out the interview for one teacher thus this research might only capture the activities and strategies conducting by the teacher in a limited period. The suggestion, the researcher adds other instruments like observation and field note to gather more data.

## REFERENCES

- Agnyoto, P. 2012. *Classroom Speaking Activities in a Conversation Class: A Case Study of One Junior High School in Bandung*. UPI: Unpublished. Available at <http://repository.upi.edu/10676/> accessed on January 20<sup>th</sup> 2020.
- Anjaniputra. 2013. *Teacher's Strategies in Teaching Speaking to Students at Secondary Level*. UI. Available at <https://ejournal.upi.edu/index.php/LE/article/viewFile/577/434> accessed on June 26<sup>th</sup> 2020.
- Brown, H. D. 2007. *Teaching by Principle: an Interactive Approach to Language Pedagogy*. White Plains, NY: Longman, USA.
- Cahyono, B. Y, & Widiati, U. 2011. *The Teaching of English as a Foreign Language in Indonesia*. Malang: State University of Malang Press.
- Gall, M. D, Borg, W. R., & Gall. J. P 2007. *Educational Research, an Introduction*. USA: Pearson Education, Inc. Eight Edition.
- Ginusti, N. G. 2014. *Improving The Speaking Skills Through Pictures*. Faculty of Language and Arts Yogyakarta State University Dean: Yogyakarta
- Harmer, J. 2007. *The Practice of Language Teaching: Fourth Edition*. Edinburg: Pearson Education Limited.
- Istanto, N. 2017. *Teachers' Problem on Teaching Speaking Skill in Agriculture Class at the Eleventh Grade of SMK N 1 Kedawung Academic Years 2016/2017*. Retrieved on <http://eprints.iain-surakarta.ac.id/712/> accessed on July 14<sup>th</sup> 2020
- Mukhtar, 2007. *Bimbingan Skripsi, Thesis, dan Artikel Ilmiah*. Ciputat: Gaung Persada.
- Newman, S. 2004. *Stepping Out: Using Games & Activities to Help Child with Special Needs*. New York: Jessica Kingsley Publishers.
- Pinter, A. 2017. *Teaching Young Language Learners*. Oxford University Press. Second Edition
- Safitri, A. 2013. *Activities in Teaching the Speaking skill to the Students with Vision Impairment*. UPI. Retrieved from <http://repository.upi.edu/3366/> accessed on June 28<sup>th</sup> 2020.
- Tohirin. 2012. *Metode Penelitian Kuantitatif dalam Pendidikan dan Bimbingan Konseling*. Jakarta: Rajagrafindo persada.

Untari, R. 2017. *Digging Problem Faced in Learning English by Visual Impaired Students in Inclusion Class at X IPS 4 MAN Klaten in the Academic year 2016/2017*. Surakarta. English Education Department. Retrieved from <http://eprints.iain-surakarta.ac.id/1293/1/FULL%20TEXT.pdf> accessed on January 29<sup>th</sup> 2020.

Wahyuni, S & Yulianti, F. 2016. *The Use of Guessing Game to Improve Student's Speaking Skill*. Banda Aceh, Aceh: STKIP BBG. Retrieved from <https://doi.org/10.46244/geej.v3i2.705> accessed on July 05<sup>th</sup> 2020.

Yin, R. K. 2011. *Qualitative research from start to Finish*. New York: The Guilfor Press.